



201 North Washington Square • Suite 910
Lansing, Michigan 48933
Telephone 517 / 482-6237 • Fax 517 / 482-6937 • www.varnumlaw.com

Timothy J. Lundgren

tjlundgren@varnumlaw.com

July 20, 2018

Ms. Kavita Kale
Executive Secretary
Michigan Public Service Commission
7109 W. Saginaw Highway
P.O. Box 30221
Lansing, MI 48909

Re: MPSC Case No. U-18352

Dear Ms. Kale:

Attached for electronic filing in the above-referenced matter, please find the Reply Brief of Energy Michigan, Inc. Thank you for your assistance in this matter.

Sincerely yours,

VARNUM

Timothy J. Lundgren

TJL/kc

Enclosures

c. All parties of record.

STATE OF MICHIGAN

BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

* * * * *

In the matter, on the Commission's own motion,)
regarding the regulatory reviews, revisions,)
determination and/or approvals necessary for)
DTE ELECTRIC COMPANY to comply)
with Section 61 of 2016 PA 342.)
_____)

Case No. U-18352

REPLY BRIEF OF ENERGY MICHIGAN, INC.

Tim Lundgren
Laura Chappelle
Varnum, LLP
Attorneys for Energy Michigan, Inc.
201 N. Washington Square, Suite 910
Lansing, MI 48933
(517) 482-6237

Contents

I. INTRODUCTION.....1

II. ARGUMENT.....1

**A. The Commission Should Reject DTE's Proposed VGP Program and
Require DTE to Develop A New VGP Program That Better Meets the
Needs of Its Customers.1**

III. CONCLUSIONS AND PRAYER FOR RELIEF.....2

STATE OF MICHIGAN

BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

* * * * *

In the matter, on the Commission's own motion,)
regarding the regulatory reviews, revisions,)
determination and/or approvals necessary for)
DTE ELECTRIC COMPANY to comply)
with Section 61 of 2016 PA 342.)
_____)

Case No. U-18352

REPLY BRIEF OF ENERGY MICHIGAN, INC.

I. INTRODUCTION

This Reply Brief is filed on behalf of Energy Michigan, Inc. ("Energy Michigan")¹ by its attorneys, Varnum LLP. Failure to address any issues or positions raised by other parties should not be taken as agreement with those issues or positions.

II. ARGUMENT

A. The Commission Should Reject DTE's Proposed VGP Program and Require DTE to Develop A New VGP Program That Better Meets the Needs of Its Customers.

In our Initial Brief, Energy Michigan took the position that that DTE Electric Company's ("DTE" or "Company") offerings in its application for a voluntary green pricing ("VGP") program pursuant to Section 61 of 2016 PA 342 ("Section 61") were deficient, and that the Commission should instruct DTE to work with its customers to develop a new VGP program that would better meet the needs of those customers, particularly the commercial and industrial customers. A broader Section 61 VGP would provide customers with increased choice and

¹ The comments expressed in this filing represent the position of Energy Michigan as an organization, but may not represent the views of any particular member of Energy Michigan.

options for types of renewable generation, locations of resources, and even ownership of the generating assets. Nothing in DTE's Initial Brief changes the positions taken by Energy Michigan, and we continue to stand behind the arguments we made in our Initial Brief, and reassert them here.

Energy Michigan supports Commission Staff's finding that DTE's VGP program should be a "significantly larger program," and "has issues regarding the transparency of the calculation of the costs of VGP products offered by the Company, the degree to which programs fees are allocated towards marketing and administration, and program accounting." MPSC Staff Initial Brief, p. 4. However, Energy Michigan disagrees with both DTE's and Staff's timing for proposed changes to the size of DTE's VGP program, which would let these significant program inadequacies remain in place until the Company's next Section 61 filing in October 2019. MPSC Staff Initial Brief, p. 5. 2 Tr 40-41. At a minimum, Energy Michigan submits that DTE should be ordered to file a broader, more transparent VGP within 6 months.

III. CONCLUSIONS AND PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, for the reasons set forth herein, as well as those set forth in its Initial Brief, Energy Michigan hereby respectfully requests that the Commission reject DTE's application, and require DTE to re-file a broader VGP program within 6 months that better meets the needs of its customers, particularly the commercial and industrial customers, and thus complies with Section 61's statutory requirements.

Respectfully submitted,

Varnum LLP
Attorneys for Energy Michigan, Inc.

July 20, 2018

By: _____

Timothy J. Lundgren (P62807)
Laura A. Chappelle (P42052)
The Victor Center
201 N. Washington Square, Ste. 910
Lansing, MI 48933
517/482-6237

13796333_1.docx

STATE OF MICHIGAN

BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the matter, on the Commission's own motion,)
regarding the regulatory reviews, revisions,)
determination and/or approvals necessary for)
DTE Electric Company to comply)
with Section 61 of 2016 PA 342)
_____)

Case No. U-18352

PROOF OF SERVICE

STATE OF MICHIGAN)
) ss.
COUNTY OF INGHAM)

Kimberly Champagne, the undersigned, being first duly sworn, deposes and says that she is a Legal Secretary at Varnum LLP and that on the 20th day of July, 2018, she served a copy of the Reply Brief of Energy Michigan, Inc., upon those individuals listed on the attached Service List via email at their last known addresses.

Kimberly Champagne

SERVICE LIST
MPSC CASE NO. U-18352

Administrative Law Judge

Honorable Martin D. Snider
7109 W. Saginaw Highway
Lansing, MI 48917
sniderm@michigan.gov

Counsel for DTE Electric Company

Andrea Hayden
DTE Electric Company
One Energy Plaza, 688 WCB
Detroit, MI 48826
andrea.hayden@dteenergy.com
mpscfilings@dteenergy.com

**Counsel for Michigan Public
Service Commission**

Amit T. Singh
Steven D. Hughey
7109 W. Saginaw Hwy., 3rd Floor
Lansing, MI 48919
singha9@michigan.gov
hugheys@michigan.gov

**Counsel for Environmental Law & Policy
Center**

Margrethe K. Kearney
Environmental Law & Policy Center
1514 Wealthy St. SE, Suite 256
Grand Rapids, MI 49506
mkearney@elpc.org

Rachel Granneman
Environmental Law & Policy Center
35 E. Wacker Drive, Suite 1600
Chicago, IL 60601
rgranneman@elpc.org

**Counsel for Michigan Environmental
Council**

Christopher M. Bzdok
Lydia Barbash-Riley
Olson, Bzdok & Howard
420 E. Front St.
Traverse City, MI 49686
chris@envlaw.com
lydia@envlaw.com
karla@envlaw.com
kimberly@envlaw.com
marcia@envlaw.com