

STATE OF MICHIGAN
BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

* * * * *

In the matter, on the Commission's own motion,)	
to implement 2008 PA 295 through issuance of)	Case No. U-15800
a temporary order as required by MCL 460.1191.)	
<hr/>)	

At the July 1, 2009 meeting of the Michigan Public Service Commission in Lansing,
Michigan.

PRESENT: Hon. Orjiakor N. Isiogu, Chairman
Hon. Monica Martinez, Commissioner
Hon. Steven A. Transeth, Commissioner

ORDER DENYING REQUESTS FOR WAIVERS

On June 2, 2009, the Michigan Municipal Electric Association (MMEA) filed, on behalf of certain of its members, a request for waiver of requirements established in Section 45(5) of 2008 PA 295 (the Act), MCL 460.1045(5), which mandates that certain information be included in monthly billing statements to customers.

The MMEA states that some of its members cannot comply with Section 45(5) without incurring substantial costs. Generally, it states, these costs arise from the need either to establish an entirely new bill format or to develop new billing software. For example, the MMEA states, if a utility uses a postcard for billing, there may not be sufficient space for adding four lines to comply with the requirements of Section 45(5). Moreover, the MMEA states, the municipal utilities tend to have a small customer base, which means the costs must be recovered from a limited number of customers. It states that some municipal utilities are thus left with a choice of

increasing customer bills significantly, decreasing the amount spent to comply with the renewable energy and energy optimization standards of the Act, or a combination of both.

The MMEA seeks to avoid the hardship that compliance would bring by requesting that municipal utilities be permitted to comply with Section 45(5) by including the required information in the annual report required by Section 51(2), MCL 460.1051(2), which requires information different from that required by Section 45(5) be placed in an annual report, which among other things, must be sent to the utility's customers.

The Commission is not persuaded that it may grant the MMEA's waiver request, no matter how sympathetic the Commission is to the municipal utilities' plight. The Commission is not empowered to exercise any authority over municipal utilities that is not expressly provided for in the Act. *See*, MCL 460.1111. Moreover, the Legislature has closely defined what it requires from rate regulated utilities, alternative electric service providers, and municipal utilities. If it had intended to provide for the Commission's authority to grant a waiver or alter the statutory requirements for avoiding financial hardship or waste, the Legislature could have and presumably would have expressly provided that authority. But it did not.

The Legislature stated clearly what it intended all electric providers to include on monthly billings to residential customers. Section 45(5) provides:

In its billing statements for a residential customer, each provider shall report to the residential customer all of the following in a format consistent with other information on the customer bill:

- (a) An itemized monthly charge, expressed in dollars and cents, collected from the customer for implementing the renewable energy program requirements of this act. In the first bill issued after the close of the previous year, an electric provider shall notify each residential customer that the customer may be entitled to an income tax credit to offset some of the annual amounts collected for the renewable energy program.

- (b) An itemized monthly charge, expressed in dollars and cents, collected from the customer for implementing the energy optimization program requirements of this act.
- (c) An estimated monthly savings, expressed in dollars and cents, for that customer to reflect the reductions in the monthly energy bill produced by the energy optimization program under this act.
- (d) An estimated monthly savings, expressed in dollars and cents, for that customer to reflect the long-term, life-cycle, levelized costs of building and operating new conventional coal-fired electric generating power plants avoided under this act as determined by the commission.
- (e) The website address at which the commission's annual report under section 51 is posted.

MCL 460.45(5).

The Commission finds no ambiguous statutory language that would permit interpreting this section to require compliance only when the costs are minimal or compliance does not create an undue burden. The Legislature did not leave compliance with the Act optional for municipal utilities and did not provide any possibility of obtaining the relief that the MMEA seeks for its member companies. Rather, the Legislature demonstrated its intent that municipal utilities should comply with the Act when it established specific enforcement provisions in MCL 460.1053. That section authorizes the Commission to adjudicate complaints of non-compliance. Upon a finding that a municipal utility has failed to comply, the Commission is to notify the Attorney General, who may obtain injunctive relief.

For all of the above reasons, the Commission finds that it is without authority to grant the relief that the MMEA seeks on behalf of its members. Nor does the Commission possess the authority to grant the MMEA's alternative request to permit each affected municipal utility to seek its own waiver. The possibility of granting the relief sought by the MMEA must be created, if at all, through the legislative process, not by administrative fiat.

THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED that the request for waiver of the requirements of MCL 460.1045(5) for municipal utilities filed by the Michigan Municipal Electric Association is denied.

The Commission reserves jurisdiction and may issue further orders as necessary.

Any party desiring to appeal this order must do so in the appropriate court within 30 days after issuance and notice of this order, under MCL 462.26.

MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Orjiakor N. Isiogu, Chairman

Monica Martinez, Commissioner

Steven A. Transeth, Commissioner

By its action of July 1, 2009.

Mary Jo Kunkle, Executive Secretary

P R O O F O F S E R V I C E

STATE OF MICHIGAN)

Case No. U-15800

County of Ingham)

Mignon Middlebrook, being duly sworn, deposes and says that on July 1, 2009, A.D. she served a copy of the attached **Commission Order** by first class mail, postage prepaid, or by inter-departmental mail, to the person(s) as shown on the attached service list(s).

Mignon Middlebrook

Subscribed and sworn to before me
this 1st day of July 2009

Sharron A. Allen
Notary Public, Ingham County, MI
My commission expires August 16, 2011

Service List – Case No. U-15800

Northern States Power Company - Wisconsin,
d/b/a Xcel Energy

Michael L. Swenson, President & CEO
1414 W. Hamilton Avenue
P.O. Box 8
Eau Claire WI 54702-0008

Edison Sault Electric Company
Donald Sawruk
725 E. Portage Avenue
Sault Ste. Marie MI 49783

Thomas E. Maier
Clark Hill PLC
212 E. Grand River Avenue
Lansing MI 48906

P R O O F O F S E R V I C E

STATE OF MICHIGAN)

Case No. U-15800

County of Ingham)

Lisa Felice being duly sworn, deposes and says that on July 1, 2009 A.D. she served a copy of the attached **Commission Order (Commission's Own Motion) via e-mail transmission**, to the persons as shown on the attached service list (Listserv Distribution List).

Lisa Felice

Subscribed and sworn to before me
this 1st day of July 2009

Sharron A. Allen
Notary Public, Ingham County, MI
My Commission Expires August 16, 2011

ontrea@CHARTERMI.NET	The Ontonagon County Rea. Assoc.
akb@ALPENAPOWER.COM	No Name Available
jbedford@ALPENAPOWER.COM	No Name Available
Jackie.Seghi@CONSTELLATION.COM	No Name Available
hendersond@DTEENERGY.COM	No Name Available
armana@MICHIGAN.GOV	No Name Available
vobmgr@UP.NET	Village of Baraga
dforgacs@SEL.COM	Direct Energy Business, LLC
info@VILLAGEOFCLINTON.ORG	Village of Clinton
jepalinc@CMSENERGY.COM	CMS Energy Resource Mgt Co
Jayne@HOMEWORKS.ORG	Tri-County Electric Co-Op
mkappler@HOMEWORKS.ORG	Tri-County Electric Co-Op
patessner@HOMEWORKS.ORG	Tri-County Electric Co-Op
psimmer@HOMEWORKS.ORG	Tri-County Electric Co-Op
aurora@FREEWAY.NET	Aurora Gas Company
frucheyb@DTEENERGY.COM	Citizens Gas Fuel Company
dwjoos@CMSENERGY.COM	Consumers Energy Company
mpscfilings@CMSENERGY.COM	Consumers Energy Company
dsawruk@EDISONSAULT.COM	Edison Sault Electric Company
lbaatz@EDISONSAULT.COM	Edison Sault Electric Company
stephen.bennett@EXELONCORP.COM	Exelon Energy Company
kdc Curry@AEP.COM	Indiana Michigan Power Company
jim.vansickle@SEMCOENERGY.COM	SEMCO Energy Gas Company
kay8643990@YAHOO.COM	Superior Energy Company
gericks@WPSR.COM	Upper Peninsula Power Company
ronan.patterson@WE-ENERGIES.COM	Wisconsin Electric Power Company
tharrell@CHARTERINTERNET.COM	Alger Delta Cooperative
patti.williams@BAYFIELDELECTRIC.COM	Bayfield Electric Cooperative
tonya@CECELEC.COM	Cherryland Electric Cooperative
dwozniak@CLOVERLAND.COM	Cloverland Electric Cooperative
sfarnquist@CLOVERLAND.COM	Cloverland Electric Cooperative
sboeckman@GLENERGY.COM	Great Lakes Energy Cooperative
mkrause@AIRADVANTAGE.NET	Thumb Electric Cooperative
rnuss@NISOURCE.COM	Energy USA- TPC Corp
rami.fawaz@POWERONECORP.COM	PowerOne Corp
cjmiszuk@FES.COM	FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.
CommissionMail@WPSR.COM	Wisconsin Public Service Corp.
llopez@LIBERTYPOWERCORP.COM	Liberty Power Delaware (Holdings)
jlehmkuhl@NILES.MI.ORG	Niles Utilities Department
kmarklein@STEPHENSON-MI.COM	Stephson Utilities Department
fzimmer@CITYOFMARSHALL.COM	Marshall Electric Dept. (Union
mpicklesmier@CITY-CHELSEA.ORG	Chelsea Department of Electric &
Water	
ktozzini@USGANDE.COM	Michigan Gas and Electric
sharonkr@PIEG.COM	Presque Isle Electric & Gas
Cooperative, INC	
tsobeck@PIEG.COM	Presque Isle Electric & Gas Co-op
igoodman@COMMERCEENERGY.COM	Commerce Energy
dhaubensak@CORNERENERGY.COM	Cornerstone Energy
mpscfilings@DTEENERGY.COM	DTE Energy
brian.hoeger@EXELONCORP.COM	Exelon Energy
vnguyen@MIDAMERICAN.COM	MidAmerican Energy
rarchiba@FOSTEROIL.COM	My Choice Energy
cborr@WPSCI.COM	Spartan Renewable Energy, Inc.
(Wolverine Po	
donald.reck@XCELENERGY.COM	Xcel Energy

cityelectric@ESCANABA.ORG
crystalfallsmgr@HOTMAIL.COM
felice@MICHIGAN.GOV
bday@SPARKENERGY.COM
nsilvestri@UNIVERSALENERGY.CA
Corporation
tomwhite@GLADSTONEMI.COM
rstickland@SOUTH-HAVEN.COM
daustin@IGSENERGY.COM
hkingerski@MXENERGY.COM
lanse2@CHARTER.NET
pnewton@BAYCITYMI.ORG
aallen@GHBLP.ORG
sbn@LBWL.COM
jreynolds@MBLP.ORG
erice@TCLP.ORG
chall@CMSENERGY.COM
dmzwitte@CMSENERGY.COM
jonesj@DTEENERGY.COM
bschlansker@PREMIERENERGYONLINE.COM
bhouse@PROLIANCE.COM
rcarrier@SEL.COM
nroehrs@STLOUISMI.COM
shelm@AMERICANPOWERNET.COM
lturbyfill@NORDICENERGY.COM
zach.halkola@TRAXYS.COM
ttarkiewicz@CITYOFMARSHALL.COM
rroller@BAARDENERGY.COM
tony@AE2.COM
kunklem@MICHIGAN.GOV
ElectricDept@PORTLAND-MICHIGAN.ORG
skm7@ALPENAPOWER.COM
trichards@LOWELL-LIGHT.ORG
blefevere@CI.EATON-RAPIDS.MI.US
ham557@GMAIL.COM
gbass@SEMPRASOLUTIONS.COM
AKlaviter@INTEGRYSENERGY.COM
jcasadont@BLUESTARENERGY.COM
john.gomoll@DIRECTENERGY.COM
galvin@LAKESHOREENERGY.COM
doug.gugino@REALGY.COM
mrunck@VEENERGY.COM
jfrench@WYAN.ORG
kmaynard@WYAN.ORG
rboston@SEMPRASOLUTIONS.COM
jgriffith@CI.STURGIS.MI.US
pbeckhusen@MUNI.CBPU.COM
akinney@HILLSDALEBPU.COM
rjrose@HILLSDALEBPU.COM
dczarnecki@CHARTERINTERNET.COM
davidw@BPW.ZEELAND.MI.US

City of Escanaba
City of Crystal Falls
Lisa Felice
Spark Energy Gas, LP
Universal Gas & Electric

City of Gladstone
City of South Haven
Interstate Gas Supply Inc
MxEnergy Inc.
Village of L'Anse
Bay City Electric Light & Power
Grand Haven Board of Light & Power
Lansing Board of Water and Light
Marquette Board of Light & Power
Traverse City Light & Power
CMS ERM Michigan LLC
CMS ERM Michigan LLC
Metro Energy LLC
Premier Energy Marketing LLC
Proliance Energy LLC
Strategic Energy LLC
City of Saint Louis
American PowerNet Management, L.P.
Nordic Marketing, L.L.C.
U.P. Power Marketing, LLC
City of Marshall
Nordic Marketing of Michigan.com
Accent Energy Midwest
Mary Jo Kunkle - MPSC
City of Portland
Alpena Power
Lowell Light and Power
City of Eaton Rapids
Lowell S.
Royal Bank of Scotland
Integrys Energy Service, Inc WPSES
BlueStar Energy Services
Direct Energy Services
Lakeshore Energy Services
Realgy Energy Services
Volunteer Energy Services
Wyandotte Municipal Services
Wyandotte Municipal Services
Semptra Energy Solutions
City of Sturgis
Coldwater Board of Public Utilities
Hillsdale Board of Public Utilities
Hillsdale Board of Public Utilities
Negunee Department of Public Works
Zeeland Board of Public Works